

Agenda



Charter Revision Commission

Date/Time: 8/10/2023 at 4:00 PM

Zoom Mtg ID: 840 4292 4344

Location(s): 244 Fair St., 6th Fl., Kingston, NY

Commission Members:

Mihm, Kathleen (Chair)	Kadgen, Thomas*	Simonofsky, D. Mici
Cardinale, Frank	McCarthy, Scott	Woltman, Brian
Donaldson, David	Parker, LeShawn	Tantillo, Fawn
Shannon Harris	Rodriguez, Hector	

* *via videoconference due to "extraordinary circumstances" pursuant to NYS Public Officers Law Section 103-A and Ulster County Local Law No. 8 of 2022*

Agenda Items:

1. Call to Order / Roll Call / Welcome Guests and Members of the Public
 2. Approval of August 3, 2023 meeting minutes [p. 2-7]
 3. Public Comment (if any)
 4. Discussion of Proposal to Make Deputy County Executive Appointments Subject to Confirmation by the Legislature
 5. Discussion of Proposed Revision to Section C-21 (Filling Membership Vacancies) Submitted by Jane Schanberg, President of Ulster County Democratic Women [p. 8-9]
 6. Review & Discussion of the Outstanding Items on the Matrix of Proposed Revisions [p. 10-19]
 7. Adjournment
-

Other Information:

Ulster County Charter Revision Commission Regular Meeting Minutes

Date/Time: August 3, 2023 at 5:05 PM (or immediately following the public hearing)

Location: Ulster County Legislative Chambers
244 Fair Street, 6th Floor, Kingston, New York 12401

Present: Kathleen Mihm (Chair)
Fawn Tantillo
D. Mici Simonofsky
Frank Cardinale
Shannon Harris
David Donaldson
Scott McCarthy
LeShawn Parker
Hector Rodriguez

Absent Thomas Kadgen
Brian Woltman

Quorum: Yes

Other Attendees: March Gallagher, Comptroller
Joseph Maloney, County Legislator, District No. 2
Johanna Contreras, Deputy County Executive
Jane Schanberg, President, Ulster County Democratic Women
Bruce Ginsberg
Martin Dunkley
Alice H. Cook
Kristin Gumaer, First Assistant County Attorney
Richie Williams, Assistant County Attorney
Dante De Leo, Assistant County Attorney

Chair Mihm called the meeting to order at 5:08 PM.

Motion No. 1: Motion to Approve July 13, 2023 Meeting Minutes

Motion made by: Commission Member Dave Donaldson

Seconded by: Commission Member Hector Rodriguez

Discussion: None.

Voting in favor: Commission Members Mihm (Chair), Simonofsky, Tantillo, Cardinale,
Rodriguez, Donaldson, Harris, Parker, McCarthy

Voting against: None

Disposition: Motion No. 1 passed 9-0.

Public Comment: Chair Mihm recognized Jane Schanberg who, on behalf of the Ulster County Democratic Women, proposed that Section C-21 of the Charter be amended to add the following sentence: “Public notice shall be given in the district of the vacancy within 3 days after the vacancy occurs.”

Bruce Ginsberg, a former member of the Human Rights Commission, spoke in support of two proposed changes to the Charter: that the County Executive no longer have 5 appointees to the Human Rights Commission, and that the Commission have the power to elect their own Chair.

Martin Dunkley, a former member of the Human Rights Commission, spoke in support of the two changes proposed by Mr. Ginsberg and stressed the importance of the independence of the Human Rights Commission.

Alice Cook, a former member of the Human Rights Commission, expressed frustration and disappointment over the manner in which she was informed that her term of membership on the Human Rights Commission had ended.

Chair Mihm recognized Legislator Joe Maloney who spoke in support of reducing the number of Executive appointees on the Human Rights Commission and in favor of the Human Rights Commission being an independent body.

Commission Member Tantillo noted that everybody including the Executive supported the change to create a Director of Human Rights as opposed to a Commissioner. Commission Member Tantillo proposed allowing the Human Rights Commission to pick their own Chair on an annual basis. Commission Member Donaldson noted that the Executive agreed to the proposal that the Human Rights Commission choose its own Chair. Commission Members discussed whether or not the Director should be a voting member. Chair Mihm recognized Deputy County Executive Johanna Contreras who advised the Commission that the Executive supports the position that the Director would not be a voting member of the Human Rights Commission.

Commission Member Donaldson spoke in support of his proposals that the Director should serve for a term and that two of the Executive appointments should be given to the Commission itself as measures to create more independence for the Human Rights Commission. Commission Member Tantillo noted that other Department Heads who are appointed to a term are appointed to a term pursuant to state law. Commission Members Donaldson, Tantillo, and Rodriguez discussed comparisons between Commission Member Donaldson’s proposed language versus language used in other sections of the Charter involving terms for Department Heads.

Chair Mihm recognized Deputy CE Contreras who spoke in support of the importance of having proper procedures in place for the Human Rights Commission. Deputy CE Contreras noted that currently the Legislature has 6 appointees to the Human Rights Commission whereas the Executive only has 5 appointees. Deputy CE Contreras spoke in support of having all of the appointments being made by elected officials like the Legislature and the Executive.

Commission Member Donaldson noted that the Executive has 5 appointments, the Chair of the Legislature has 3, and the Minority Leader has 3, and each is done separately. Commission Member Donaldson noted that in his proposal, 9 members would be appointed by elected officials, while 2 would be appointed by the Commissioners. Commission Member Rodriguez noted that the Reapportionment Commission already appoints some of its own Commissioners. Commission Member Tantillo spoke in support of Commission Member Donaldson's proposal.

Commission Members discussed what role the Director would have. Chair Mihm recognized Mr. Ginsberg who advised the Commission that currently the Director/Commissioner receives and vets complaints. Commission Member Donaldson noted that his proposals have nothing to do with what is currently happening with the Human Rights Commission and that he has wanted to make these changes for a long time. Commission Member Tantillo expressed thanks to the County Executive and her staff for supporting the Commissioners being able to select their own Chairperson and changing the name of the Director.

Deputy CE Contreras advised the Commission that the Executive's agreed that the Director should not be a voting member of the Human Rights Commission. Commission Member Rodriguez noted that the Executive's proposal in C-101(B) stated that the Director shall be the Chairperson of the Human Rights Commission. Deputy CE Contreras advised the Commission that the Executive is no longer making that proposal.

Commission Member Harris noted that she did not hear strong opposition from the Executive's Office on the proposed changes and expressed that it is reasonable for the Human Rights Commission to have their own 2 appointments. Chair Mihm spoke in support of the Executive's position that appointments to the Human Rights Commission should be made by elected officials. Chair Mihm noted that the Human Rights Commission is currently balanced because the Legislature has 6 appointments, and the Executive has 5. Commission Member Donaldson noted that the majority and minority leader each have 3 appointments and are typically from different political parties. Commission Member McCarthy spoke in support of the proposal that the Human Rights Commission should be able to make their own 2 appointments. Commission Member Parker noted that the Human Rights Commission should not be pulled by politics and spoke in support of the proposal that the Human Rights Commission should be able to make their own 2 appointments. Commission Member Rodriguez spoke in support of the proposals that there should be a term for the Director and that the Human Rights Commission should be able to make their own 2 appointments. Chair Mihm questioned why appointments should be taken from the Executive and not from the Legislature. Chair Mihm noted that the concern of the former Commission of Human Rights was that the Legislature failed to make timely appointments. Commission Member Cardinale noted that it should be a function of the Director to make Legislators aware that they need to make appointments. Commission Member Cardinale spoke in favor of the Commission focusing on what everyone agrees on.

Motion No. 2: Motion to Approve the Proposed Revision to Section C-100(A), Set Forth in County Executive's Recommendation 8, that:

“There shall be a ~~Commission~~ Department of Human Rights headed by a ~~Commissioner~~ Director of Human Rights who shall be appointed by the County Executive, subject to confirmation of the Legislature, and serve at ~~his or her~~ their pleasure.”

Motion made by: Commission Member Fawn Tantillo

Seconded by: Commission Member Mici Simonofsky

Discussion: Commission Members discussed whether language needed to be added to clarify that the Director should not be a voting member of the Human Rights Commission. Commission Members decided that the language should not be included in this motion. Commission Member Tantillo proposed adding the proposed 3-year term to the motion but the Commission decided against it.

Voting in favor: Commission Members Mihm (Chair), Simonofsky, Tantillo, Cardinale, Rodriguez, Donaldson, Harris, Parker, McCarthy

Voting against: None

Disposition: Motion No. 2 passed 9-0.

Motion No. 3: Motion to Add the Following Sentence to Section C-100(A):

“The Director shall serve as an ex officio, non-voting member, of the Human Rights Commission.”

Motion made by: Commission Member Hector Rodriguez

Seconded by: Commission Member Fawn Tantillo

Discussion: None.

Voting in favor: Commission Members Mihm (Chair), Simonofsky, Tantillo, Cardinale, Rodriguez, Donaldson, Harris, Parker, McCarthy

Voting against: None

Disposition: Motion No. 3 passed 9-0.

Motion No. 4: Motion to Amend Section C-101(B) as follows:

“The Commission of Human Rights shall have 11 members appointed to terms of three years, three members of which shall be appointed by the legislative Chairperson, three members by the legislative minority leader, and five members by the County Executive, ~~one of which shall be designated by him or her as the Commission Chairperson.~~ **The Commissioners will select a Chairperson from among their members at the first meeting of each calendar year.** Appointments shall be representative of the diversity in Ulster County’s communities. Consideration shall be given but not limited to representation of gender,

gender identity, racial, ethnic, socioeconomic, age, cultural, religious, geographic, and disability diversity. No member of the Commission of Human Rights shall serve more than four consecutive terms of three years.”

Motion made by: Commission Member Fawn Tantillo

Seconded by: Commission Member Hector Rodriguez

Discussion: Commission Members discussed what changes should be included in the motion.

Voting in favor: Commission Members Mihm (Chair), Simonofsky, Tantillo, Cardinale, Rodriguez, Donaldson, Harris, Parker, McCarthy

Voting against: None

Disposition: Motion No. 4 passed 9-0.

Motion No. 5: Motion to Approve to Amend Section C-101(B) as follows:

“The Commission of Human Rights shall have 11 members appointed to terms of three years, three members of which shall be appointed by the legislative Chairperson, three members by the legislative minority leader, and five three members by the County Executive, and two members chosen by the members of the Commission. The Commissioners will select a Chairperson from among their members at the first meeting of each calendar year. Appointments shall be representative of the diversity in Ulster County’s communities. Consideration shall be given but not limited to representation of gender, gender identity, racial, ethnic, socioeconomic, age, cultural, religious, geographic, and disability diversity. No member of the Commission of Human Rights shall serve more than four consecutive terms of three years.”

Motion made by: Commission Member Fawn Tantillo

Seconded by: Commission Member Scott McCarthy

Discussion: This revision was proposed by Commission Member Donaldson.

Voting in favor: Commission Members Tantillo, Cardinale, Rodriguez, Donaldson, Harris, Parker, McCarthy

Voting against: Commission Members Mihm (Chair), Simonofsky

Disposition: Motion No. 5 passed 7-2.

Commission Members discussed the proposed revision to impose a term on the Director of the

Human Rights Commission. Commission Member Harris questioned the rationale behind the proposal and noted that it was a business issue for the County. Commission Members discussed the issue at length and compared and contrasted the Director's role with other Department Heads with terms. Commission Members discussed the process for removing Department Heads with terms. Commission Members discussed the need for training for Human Rights Commissioners and the Director.

Commission Member Harris left the meeting at 6:53 PM.

Motion No. 6: Motion to Adjourn

Motion made by: Commission Member Dave Donaldson

Seconded by: Commission Member Mici Simonofsky

Discussion: None.

Voting in favor: Commission Members Mihm (Chair), Simonofsky, Tantillo, Cardinale, Rodriguez, Donaldson, Parker, McCarthy

Voting against: None

Disposition: Motion No. 6 passed 8-0.

Meeting adjourned at 6:56 PM.

Meeting minutes prepared by Assistant County Attorney Dante De Leo



UCDW PROPOSES AN ULSTER COUNTY CHARTER CHANGE TO MANDATE PUBLIC NOTICE WHEN A LEGISLATOR RESIGNS

August 3, 2023 - Kingston, NY

Good Afternoon Ladies and Gentlemen,

Thank you Chair Mihm for allowing us this time to speak to you.

I am Jane Schanberg, a voter in New Paltz Village and President of the Ulster County Democratic Women. I am here to advocate a change in the County Charter Article II Paragraph C-21 — Filling Legislative Vacancies — which my membership fully supports.

As a child of Civil Rights, my politics were shaped during my teens when I saw beatings, lynchings and violence in the South simply because people were trying to vote.

Voting is sacred and I will always resist anyone's vote being muted in any way.

When my Village of New Paltz Legislator resigned in April, Village voters were never publicly notified of the vacancy in LD 20.

Voters were not told about the replacement process, and kept in the dark about who the replacement would be until the night the legislature actually voted.

Even the Village Mayor claimed he didn't know.

It's incumbent upon the Charter to ensure that voters in any district of this County be publicly notified when their county legislator steps down so this never happens again.

Therefore, on principle, we propose a one-sentence amendment to Paragraph C-21 of the Charter which would mandate public notice of a vacancy in any Legislative District within 3 days of that vacancy occurring. We feel this is the correct cure.

We respectfully request that you consider this simple but significant change and can agree that it must be added to the Charter as a matter of voting integrity and without any negative consequence.

We also request this change be made at the earliest possible date so that voters in any legislative district in the County are duly informed should any future vacancy occur.

I am at your disposal for any questions or discussions on this issue.

Many thanks for your time and consideration.



August 3, 2023

PETITION TO REVISE ARTICLE II, PARAGRAPH C-21 OF THE ULSTER COUNTY CHARTER

Current language, Section and Paragraph of the Charter

Article II - Legislative Branch

¶ C-21 Filling Membership Vacancies

A vacancy in the County Legislature shall be filled by appointment by the County Legislature of a qualified elector residing within the district no later than 30 days from the time at which the vacancy occurs. If the appointment is not made within 30 days, a special election shall be conducted to fill the vacancy within 90 days after the vacancy occurs; provided, however, that if there is a scheduled general election within 120 days after said vacancy occurs, the vacancy shall be filled at that general election. A person who fills a vacancy, if appointed or elected at a special election, shall serve until commencement of the calendar year next succeeding the first general election after the happening of the vacancy at which a successor may be elected, and the vacancy shall be filled at such election for the unexpired term. A person elected at a general election to fill a vacancy shall serve out the remainder of the term for that seat.

Proposed revision - to add the following sentence:

Public notice shall be given in the district of the vacancy within 3 days after the vacancy occurs.

Revised ¶ C-21 - Filling Membership Vacancies

A vacancy in the County Legislature shall be filled by appointment by the County Legislature of a qualified elector residing within the district no later than 30 days from the time at which the vacancy occurs. **Public notice shall be given in the district of the vacancy within 3 days after the vacancy occurs.** If the appointment is not made within 30 days, a special election shall be conducted to fill the vacancy within 90 days after the vacancy occurs; provided, however, that if there is a scheduled general election within 120 days after said vacancy occurs, the vacancy shall be filled at that general election. A person who fills a vacancy, if appointed or elected at a special election, shall serve until commencement of the calendar year next succeeding the first general election after the happening of the vacancy at which a successor may be elected, and the vacancy shall be filled at such election for the unexpired term. A person elected at a general election to fill a vacancy shall serve out the remainder of the term for that seat. # # #

WRITTEN SUBMISSIONS TO ULSTER COUNTY CHARTER REVISION COMMISSION

#	Submitted By	Description of Change	Date Submitted	Determination	Relevant Charter Section(s)
38	Thomas Kadgen	Reimburse up to \$10,000 court and attorney fees to any plaintiff that successfully sues County for breaching Charter	3/23/2023	Revision Declined	1
102	Phil Erner	Adopt preamble to the Charter	5/1/2023		1
8	March Gallagher	Convene Charter Revision Commission at least once every five years	10/4/2022	Revision Accepted	5
51	Legislature	Charter Revision Commission convenes every 10 years	3/1/2023	Seeking Reconsideration	5
52	Legislature	Charter revision commission meets every 10 years *from the previous Commission's first meeting*	3/1/2023	Seeking Reconsideration	5
103	Legislature	"Amendment or revision by Commission. Within five years after the enactment of this Charter, No later than April 15, 2032 and at least every 10 years thereafter, a Charter Revision Commission shall be appointed to review and make recommendations to the County Executive and Legislature on amendments, additions or revisions to this County Charter. Nothing shall preclude the convening of a Charter Revision Commission at any time should the County Executive and County Legislature agree on the need to convene the Commission. "	5/1/2023		5
104	Legislature	Require two duly noticed public hearings instead of one public hearing on any Charter change proposed directly to the ballot	5/1/2023	Accepted 5/24/2023	5
9	March Gallagher	Clarify definition of "department"	10/4/2022	Accepted 3/9/2023	6
10	March Gallagher	Add definition for "departmental estimates"	10/4/2022	Accepted 3/9/2023	6
81	Hector Rodriguez	Add definition of "read-only access"	4/10/2023	Accepted 4/10/2023	6
105	Legislature	Remove definition of "clerk"	5/1/2023	Accepted 5/24/2023	6
106	Legislature	Define "departmental estimates" to read "Also referred to as Departmental, Agency, Office or Unit Estimates. Any and all documentation setting forth preliminary and/or final budget estimates for a given department agency, office or unit within Ulster County Government, together with any and all supporting documentation relied upon during the creation of said estimate(s), including reports, memorandums, graphs and/or charts. Departmental Estimates include estimates of expenses and revenues but are not required to include both.	5/1/2023		6
64	Town Supervisors	Convert County Legislature to a Board of Overseers format of government	3/9/2023	Revision Declined 4/17/2023	7
98	Phil Erner	All legislators term out after decennial redistricting	5/1/2023		8
53	Legislature	No county legislator shall hold other elective public office, <u>excepting membership on School Board</u>	3/1/2023	Revision Declined 4/17/2023	9
48	Thomas Kadgen	Add language to section on reapportionment commission where decision on chair can be changed at any time	2/2/2023	Revision Accepted with change	10
54	Legislature	Request section allowing the reconvening of the commission on reapportionment	3/1/2023	Accepted 4/17/2023	10
62	Fawn Tantillo	County Executive ensures qualifications for reapportionment appointees	2/10/2023	Accepted 4/17/2023	10
63	Fawn Tantillo	Provide mechanism for reconvening reapportionment committee	2/10/2023	Accepted 4/17/2023	10
107	Legislature	Correct typo to read "fully appointed for the purposes of receiving its charge"	5/1/2023	Accepted 5/24/2023	10
108	Legislature	"The Commission shall be guided by the criteria set forth in C-10A of the County Charter and state law. "	5/1/2023		10
109	Legislature	Require Commission to hold a minimum of three geographically diverse and duly noticed public hearings, instead of "one or more", one of which to be held in the County seat	5/1/2023	Accepted 5/24/2023	10

WRITTEN SUBMISSIONS TO ULSTER COUNTY CHARTER REVISION COMMISSION

11	March Gallagher	Raise threshold for executive contracts from \$50,000 to \$100,000	10/4/2022	Reconsidered	11
28	Ed Jordan	Increase cost threshold for contracts being approved by the Legislature.	11/2/2022	Reconsidered	11
29	Brendan Masterson	Increase cost threshold for contracts being approved by the Legislature.	11/2/2022	Reconsidered	11
35	Thomas Kadgen	Mandatory issuance of subpoena if request for material is ignored or denied	11/18/2022	Revision Declined	11
36	Thomas Kadgen	Add provision to allow Legislature to act on any mandate that fails to be met or impasse	11/18/2022	Revision Declined	11
50	Legislature	Contract approval stays at \$50k	3/1/2023	Reconsidered	11
55	Legislature	Prohibit renaming of positions without legislative oversight and approval	3/1/2023		11
67	Thomas Kadgen	Appoint an oversight committee for capital projects over 1 million dollars	3/23/2023	Revision Declined 4/6/2023	11
151	Charter Revision Commi	Amend C-11(K) to allow subpoena of "documents (including digital records and read only access to software licensed by or owned by the County or its component units."	6/8/2023	Revision Accepted 6/8/2023	11
87	Phil Erner	Appointments to include representation from all geographic areas of County on Legislative or Executive Boards & Commissions.	5/1/2023		16
110	Legislature	"There shall be Counsel to the Legislature" instead of "There shall be a Counsel to the Legislature"	5/1/2023	Revision Accepted 5/24/2023	20
41	Thomas Kadgen	Successor in the instance of a legislator vacancy should come from the same party as the legislator who left the seat	11/22/2022	Revision Declined 4/6/2023	21
66	Thomas Kadgen	Require County Executive to be a qualified elector of the County for a period of 3 years	3/2/2023	Accepted 4/6/2023	23
93	Phil Erner	Specify that "Clerk" is the "Clerk of the Legislature"	5/1/2023		25
111	Legislature	C-25(H) Change "executive policies" to "executive procedures"	5/1/2023		25
112	Legislature	C-25(P): Strike provision	5/1/2023	Revision Declined 6/1/2023	25
56	Legislature	Require notification when vacancy is created by departure of a department head	3/1/2023	Accepted 5/24/2023	26
86	Phil Erner	Outside work prohibited for all Department Heads.	5/1/2023		26
92	Phil Erner	Disallow an individual serving as head of two or more departments or administrative units of government	5/1/2023		26
88	Phil Erner	Appointments to include representation from all geographic areas of County on Legislative or Executive Boards & Commissions.	5/1/2023		28
129	County Executive	Include language: "Individuals who serve on Ulster County Boards are serving functionally as representatives of Ulster County, and as such, must be in compliance with Ulster County's Standard Operating Procedures and Training Requirements. Every Board Member of an Ulster County Government board shall be mandated to complete an ethics training provided by the Ulster County Attorney's Office within 1 year of employment, and every year thereafter."	5/1/2023	Revision Rejected 7/13/2023	28
31	Brian Woltman	Adopt succession plan for County Executive including election of a C.E. and Prime Deputy ticket	11/10/2022	Revision Declined 5/24/2023	29
61	Board of Elections	Change method for replacing County Executive upon vacancy.	2/22/2023	Revision Accepted 5/24/2023	29

WRITTEN SUBMISSIONS TO ULSTER COUNTY CHARTER REVISION COMMISSION

68	Thomas Kadgen	<i>A vacancy for Executive shall be filled by an Acting Executive chosen by a majority of the Ulster County Legislature. That the Acting Executive shall serve at the pleasure of the Legislature until a new Executive is elected. That the election for the unfinished term of the ex-Executive shall have enough time to go through either a State or County scheduled primary. of which shall be determined by a majority of the County Legislature.</i>	3/23/2023	Revision Declined 4/11/2023	29
113	Legislature	<i>C-29(G): Replace language to clean up provision</i>	5/1/2023	Revision Declined 6/1/2023	29
148	Charter Revision Commi	Amend C-29(B) to read "only a person who is a qualified elector of Ulster County and incumbent in County government may be designated to any list of succession for possible service as Acting County Executive and shall remain a qualified elector throughout the term of office"	6/8/2023	Revision Accepted 6/8/2023	29
149	Charter Revision Commi	Amend C-29(H) to add "the Acting County Executive shall hold no other elected public office or full-time employment and shall devote full time to the duties of the office."	6/8/2023	Revision Accepted 6/8/2023	29
150	Charter Revision Commi	Amend C-29(G) to read "Every new County Executive entering into a terms shall file the name of two persons to serve as Acting County Executive to take effect immediately. Within 10 days thereafter, the County Executive shall file a list with the County Clerk and Clerk of the Legislature consisting of one or more names to serve as ACting County Executive. Such list shall be subject to confirmation by the Legislature. Such list may be modified from time to time subject to confirmation by the Legislature. In the absence of such written designation of order of succession and in the event of the County Executive's inability to perform and exercise the powers and duties of his or her office, the County Legislature shall appoint a person then serving in County government to serve as Acting County Executive."	6/8/2023	Revision Accepted 6/8/2023	29
12	March Gallagher	<i>Make it clear departmental estimates must be shared to the Legislature. Give Legislature and Comptroller view only access to the budget requests made by the departments. In the current financial system (New World/Logos/Tyler ERP) these are called "Level 1 Budget Worksheets". Make Department heads send a hard copy to the Legislature.</i>	10/4/2022	Clarified in 3/9/2023 Submission	33
57	Legislature	Budget estimates should be provided to Legislature and Comptroller when submitted to Commissioner of Finance	3/1/2023		33
65	March Gallagher	Require copy of estimates to be submitted to the Clerk "and the Comptroller upon the proposal of the executive budget"	3/9/2023	Revision Accepted 4/17/2023	33

The head of each department, agency, office or unit of County government shall submit to the County Executive, in writing, and through such channels and processes as specified by ~~herhim or himher, an overall estimate~~ a request for that department, agency, office or unit and estimates by program within that department, agency, office or unit of personnel, equipment and contractual appropriations for the operation of said department, agency, office or unit ~~expected expenses~~ and expected departmental revenues for the next ensuing fiscal year. A copy of said ~~requests~~ estimates from each department, agency, office or unit shall be ~~simultaneously~~ submitted by the first Friday in August to the Clerk of the Legislature. These ~~requests~~ estimates shall be called "departmental requests", ~~estimates~~ and shall be organized with proposed grand totals of expenses and revenues for personnel services and other than personnel services for the department, agency, office or unit and proposed subtotal appropriations for personnel services and other than personnel services for each program within each department, agency, office or unit. A statement of actual expenses and actual revenues for the immediately preceding completed fiscal year, budgeted expenditures and revenues for the current fiscal year, and expenditures and revenues to date for the current fiscal year shall be included in departmental submission, prepared in the same specified format for comparison purposes. Each departmental estimate of expenses and revenue by program shall be supported by such other detail and other supporting information concerning the economy, efficiency and effectiveness of departmental performance as the County Executive shall require. Departmental ~~requests~~ estimates shall be public records and shall at all reasonable times be open to public inspection and published with the County Executive's budget submission.

58 Legislature	Release date for proposed budget advanced one month (i.e. first Friday in September)	3/1/2023	34
69 March Gallagher	Include language: The proposed County budget shall include economic and revenue forecasting to provide guidance on the current conditions in, and probable outlook for the performance of, the economy of the state and county, as well as the effect of such conditions and such performance on county receipts. The forecasting shall speak to expected tax receipts on an all-funds basis and anticipated miscellaneous receipts to be received in the general fund.	4/6/2023 Pending Further Discussion as of 4/10/2023	34
78 March Gallagher	Include language: "The proposed County budget shall include economic and revenue forecasting to provide guidance on the current conditions in, and probable outlook for the performance of, the economy of the state and county, as well as the effect of such conditions and such performance on county receipts. The forecasting shall speak to expected tax receipts on an all-funds basis and anticipated miscellaneous receipts to be received in the general fund."	4/6/2023 Pending Further Discussion as of 4/10/2023	34
114 Legislature	Charter calls for a six-year capital program, but Ulster County's program has consistently been five years	5/1/2023	34
115 Legislature	C-34(B) Require submission of a statement of actual expenses and actual revenues for three preceding completed fiscal years, rather than one	5/1/2023	34

WRITTEN SUBMISSIONS TO ULSTER COUNTY CHARTER REVISION COMMISSION

59	Legislature	Allow a Legislature-designated committee to attend public hearings on the proposed Budget, rather than requiring the entire Legislature	3/1/2023	Revision Accepted 6/1/2023	37
13	March Gallagher	Establish a deadline of December 31 for public posting of the budget	10/4/2022	Revision Accepted	38
60	Legislature	Disallow transfer of budget to allow for increase of rate of pay or annual salary of county employment position	3/1/2023	Revision Accepted 6/1/2023	40
117	Legislature	Strike requirement that Commissioner of Health be a licensed physician with experience in public health	5/1/2023	Revision Accepted 6/1/2023	41
131	County Executive	<i>Remove requirement to be medical doctor, add requirement to have at least a master's degree in public health</i>	5/1/2023	Revision Declined 6/1/2023	41
45	Barbara Hill	Raise maximum term limit for service on CSB	12/8/2022		45
46	Barbara Hill	Increase mental health subcommittee size to 11 persons from 9	12/8/2022		45
132	County Executive	<u>There shall be separate subcommittees for mental health, developmental disabilities, and substance abuse. The number of members comprising each subcommittee shall be set pursuant to Section 41 of NYS Mental Hygiene Law and shall include at least three currently serving Community Service Board members.</u> There shall be disability subcommittees of nine members each, three members of whom must also be currently serving Community Service Board members;	5/1/2023		45
118	Legislature	Strike requirement that County Executive choose Planning Director from three nominees provided by the County Planning Board, require Director of Planning to be appointed on the basis of professional training and experience and other qualifications. Allow for "at least" three recommendations by Planning Board	5/1/2023	Revision Accepted as modified 6/1/2023	46
133	County Executive	There shall be a Department of Planning, headed by a Director of Planning <u>who possesses at least the minimum educational attainments, professional qualifications and administrative experience set out in New York State law.</u> The County Executive shall appoint the Director of Planning, from among three nominees given him or her by the Ulster County Planning Board, subject to confirmation by the Legislature. The Planning Board may nominate only persons possessed of at least the minimum educational attainments, professional qualifications and administrative experience set out in New York State law. In the event that the County Planning Board fails to bring forward to the County Executive three recommendations for the position within 90 days of the occurrence of a vacancy, the County Executive shall make the appointment on his or her own initiative, subject to confirmation by the Legislature.	5/1/2023		46
134	County Executive	The Director of Planning and/ or the County Planning Board shall perform such other and related duties as required by the County Executive or County Legislature.	5/1/2023		47
49	Planning Board	Allow Planning Director to review proposed actions in event the Planning Board is unable to act	2/9/2023	Revision Accepted	50
119	Legislature	C-50(B): Strike "prepared by the Department of Planning"	5/1/2023	Revision Accepted 6/8/2023	50
120	Legislature	Require submission of recommendations to County Legislature in addition to County Executive	5/1/2023	Revision Accepted 6/8/2023	50

WRITTEN SUBMISSIONS TO ULSTER COUNTY CHARTER REVISION COMMISSION

14 March Gallagher	The Commissioner of Finance shall hold no other elected public office or compensated employment and shall devote full time to the duties of the office. The Commissioner of Finance must be free from any conflicts of interest, must be capable of providing objecting and impartial judgment, and must maintain both independence of mind and independence in appearance in the performance of their duties.	10/4/2022 Accepted 4/10/2023	53
15 March Gallagher	<i>Add Commissioner of Finance responsibility for timelines to enforce real property tax. Foreclosures should be processed as expeditiously as possible, with an annual review of all hazardous properties, a committee structure to review properties being withheld from the foreclosure action.</i>	10/4/2022 Withdrawn	53
16 March Gallagher	Add enforcement power/duties related to Ulster County's Occupancy Tax so that it's clear the Finance Commissioner has enforcement responsibility.	10/4/2022 Accepted 4/10/2023	53
17 March Gallagher	Change the required submission date of the Annual Update Document (AUD) [Financial Report] to the Legislature to mirror the due date in state law (May 1st). In practice, the AUD is never submitted to the Legislature prior to May 1.	10/4/2022 Accepted	53
18 March Gallagher	Place responsibility with Commissioner of Finance for reconciling the county's bank accounts. And create a deadline for notifying the County Comptroller of any new account within 30 days of opening.	10/4/2022 Accepted 1/12/2023	53
70 March Gallagher	Include subsection: Ensure proper segregation of duties within financial procedures	4/6/2023 Accepted 4/10/2023	53
121 Legislature	Commissioner of Finance "shall devote full working time to the duties of the office"	5/1/2023 Accepted 6/8/2023	53
121 Legislature	<i>Director of Real Property Tax Service should be subject to confirmation by the Legislature</i>	5/1/2023 Rejected 5/8/2023	53
121 Legislature	Strike provision and reserve section	5/1/2023 Accepted 6/8/2023	54
19 March Gallagher	The Comptroller shall hold no other elected public office or compensated employment and shall devote full time to the duties of the office.	10/4/2022 Accepted 4/10/2023	56
20 March Gallagher	The Comptroller shall use risk assessment to identify weaknesses in internal controls and shall summarize improvements in internal controls in an annual audit report to the Legislature and Executive by April 1 of each year.	10/4/2022 Revision Accepted	57
21 March Gallagher	Remove bank reconciliations from Comptroller's responsibilities	10/4/2022 Revision Accepted 1/12/2023 Meeting	57
22 March Gallagher	Provide Comptroller authority to audit revenues	10/4/2022 Revision Accepted	57
23 March Gallagher	Provide explicit authority to audit public benefit corporations or component units of County government	10/4/2022 Revision Accepted 4/10/2023	57
24 March Gallagher	Grant authority to subpoena documents including digital records and access to software licensed or owned by the County	10/4/2022 Revision Accepted 4/10/2023	57
72 March Gallagher	Include language: The Comptroller shall have read-only access to all software systems of the County except where precluded by law.	4/5/2023 Accepted 4/10/2023	57
73 March Gallagher	C-57(B) include language: "and investments"; provided read-only access to all County accounts	4/5/2023 Accepted 4/10/2023	57
74 March Gallagher	<i>C-57(D) include language: "contract related payments"</i>	4/5/2023 Withdrawn 4/10/2023	57
75 March Gallagher	C-57(E) include language: "and journal entries"	4/5/2023 Accepted 4/10/2023	57
76 March Gallagher	C-57(J) change "required" to "requested"	4/5/2023 Accepted 4/10/2023	57

WRITTEN SUBMISSIONS TO ULSTER COUNTY CHARTER REVISION COMMISSION

79	March Gallagher	Include language: "The Comptroller shall be authorized to have read-only access to all County accounts and be provided access to all such accounts at all times."	4/5/2023	Accepted 4/10/2023	57
122	Legislature	Remove Comptroller authority to "appoint citizens' committees, commissions and boards"	5/1/2023	Rejected 5/8/2023	57
25	March Gallagher	Remove Charter sections regarding filling of Comptroller vacancy by Legislature	10/4/2022	Subcommittee	60
77	March Gallagher	Require comptroller vacancy to be filled according to independence standards set forth by the USGAO	4/5/2023	Accepted 4/10/2023	60
123	Legislature	C-62(B) Amend to read "social services programs" rather than "social service institutions"	5/1/2023	Accepted 6/8/2023	62
124	Legislature	C-63(4) Amend to read "tangible property" instead of "personal property"	5/1/2023	Withdrawn	63
39	Thomas Kadgen	County Attorney must be confirmed by Legislature	11/22/2022	Accepted 4/6/2023	69
71	March Gallagher	Include language: The Director of Purchasing must be free from any conflicts of interest, must be capable of providing objective and impartial judgment, and must maintain both independence of mind and independence in appearance in the performance of their duties.	4/6/2023	Pending Further Discussion as of 4/10/2023	74
135	County Executive	C-74(B)(4): Perform such other and related duties as shall be required and delegated by the County Executive, or County Legislature.	5/1/2023	Revision Rejected 7/13/2023	74
125	Legislature	Remove "shall devote full working time to the duties of the office" from provision	5/1/2023		77
1	Patrick Long	Remove reference to Consumer Fraud Bureau	9/16/2022	Revision Accepted	93
94	Phil Erner	Change "Consumer Fraud Bureau" to "Consumer Protection Bureau"	5/1/2023		93
26	March Gallagher	Remove section on residential healthcare facilities	10/4/2022	Revision Accepted	99
44	Human Rights Comm.	Chair of Commission selected by commission, not County Executive	12/8/2022	Revision Accepted	100
89	Phil Erner	Retitle Commissioner of Human Rights as Director of Human Rights	5/1/2023	Revision Accepted	100
136	County Executive	Rename section "Department of Human Rights"	5/1/2023	Revision Accepted	100
137	County Executive	Edit C-100(A): "There shall be a Commission Department of Human Rights headed by a Commissioner Director of Human Rights who shall be appointed by the County Executive, subject to confirmation of the Legislature, and serve at his- or-her/their pleasure."	5/1/2023	Revision Accepted 8/10/2023	100
138	County Executive	Add C-100(B): "Powers and Duties. The Director of Human Rights shall have managerial responsibility for the Department and administrative responsibility for the Commission of Human Rights. In consultation with the Commission, the Director shall recommend policies and programs to address discrimination in employment, housing, public accommodation, education, and credit; expand public education and awareness of human rights; and foster harmony between the diverse communities within Ulster County."	5/1/2023		100
152	Dave Donaldson	Create three year term for Commissioner of Human Rights, removal subject to legislative approval	7/13/2023		100
154	Charter Revision Comm.	Add language "The Director shall serve as an ex officio non-voting member of the Human Rights Commission"	8/10/2023	Revision Accepted 8/10/2023	100
42	Human Rights Comm.	Allow for filling of long-vacant seats by Commissioner	12/8/2022		101
43	Human Rights Comm.	Increase number of members from 11 to 15	12/8/2022		101

WRITTEN SUBMISSIONS TO ULSTER COUNTY CHARTER REVISION COMMISSION

126	Legislature	Require member diversification by amending to read: "Appointments shall be representative of the diversity in Ulster County's communities. Consideration shall be given but not limited to representation of gender, gender identity, racial, ethnic, socioeconomic, age, cultural, religious, geographic and disability diversity."	5/1/2023	Revision Accepted 6/8/2023	101
139	County Executive	Rename section "The Commission of Human Rights"	5/1/2023		101
140	County Executive	Edit C-101(A): " <u>There shall be a</u> Commission of Human Rights <u>that</u> shall be constituted in accordance with and exercise the powers and duties specified in Article 12-D of the General Municipal Law and other related duties required by the County Executive and/or the County Legislature."	5/1/2023		101
141	County Executive	<u>Edit C-101(B): "Membership; duties; appointments; terms of office. The Commission of Human Rights shall have 11 members appointed to terms of three years, three members of which shall be appointed by the legislative Chairperson, three members by the legislative minority leader. Appointments shall be representative of the geographic and demographic diversity of Ulster County, taking into account faith, various religious, racial, ethnicity, and nationality. groups in Ulster County's communities gender identity, sexual preference, class, ability, marital/familial status, age, and criminal history."</u>	5/1/2023		101
153	Dave Donaldson	Reduce County Executive's appointments from five to three, allow Commissioners to choose other two appointees	7/13/2023	Revision Accepted 8/10/2023	101
155	Charter Revision Commi	Revise language: remove "one of which shall be designated by him or her as the Commission Chairperson," add "The Commissioners will select a Chairperson from among their members at the first meeting of each calendar year."	8/10/2023	Revision Accepted 8/10/2023	101
142	County Executive	Rename section "Authority of Commission."	5/1/2023		102
47	Nina Postupack	County Historian Appointed by Clerk instead of Exec	1/12/2023	Revision Accepted	103
40	Thomas Kadgen	Periodic Compensation Board member qualification should exclude former county officials for four years from separation	11/22/2022	Revision Accepted 4/17/2023	108
82	Phil Erner	Abolish the Periodic Compensation Review Committee & determine salaries of elected officers as follows: sliding-scale compensation, providing a minimum living wage to the wealthiest and a maximum of the median area income for the poorest, all adjusted for family size. For legislators, assume a 30-hour workweek. For County-wide electeds assume a 60-hour workweek.	5/1/2023		108
83	Phil Erner	Abolish the Periodic Compensation Review Committee and set all county-wide elected salaries as equaling the Area Mean Income (AMI) adjusted for family size; and for Legislators, assume a 30-hour workweek to earn 75 percent of adjusted AMI adjusted for family size.	5/1/2023		108
27	March Gallagher	Require periodic compensation review commission's findings to be incorporated into County Executive's proposed budget unless previously adopted by local law	10/4/2022		110
37	Thomas Kadgen	Mandate salary recommendations of periodic compensation board be placed before Legislature in separate salary categories for a vote	11/18/2022		110
143	County Executive	Add County Director of Environment as ex officio member of EMC	5/1/2023		111

WRITTEN SUBMISSIONS TO ULSTER COUNTY CHARTER REVISION COMMISSION

144	County Executive	The Deputy Director of the Youth Bureau shall be appointed by the Director have the power to appoint a Deputy Director of the Youth Bureau , in accord with and within the limits of the appropriation provided for this purpose, after consultation with the County Executive on the basis of his or her their education and experience.	5/1/2023	122
2	Nancy Schmidt	Remove reference to Community Corrections Department	9/29/2022	Revision Accepted
3	Juan Figueroa	Streamline budget approval process	9/29/2022	
4	Juan Figueroa	County Attorney works for county executive, not the elected officials of the county	9/29/2022	
5	Brian Slack	Increase number of Traffic Safety Board appointees from 12 to 15	10/5/2022	Revision Declined
6	Thomas Kadgen	Process for filling vacancies for vacated offices	10/5/2022	Elaborated in 11/14 submission
7	Thomas Kadgen	Charter has been ignored/circumvented	10/5/2022	Elaborated in 11/14 submission
30	Dawn Spader	Add language to department head descriptions to include vesting authority, direction, and control over the department, including power to appoint and remove officers and employees within the department	10/13/2022	Revision Accepted
32	Thomas Kadgen	Executive, Comptroller, and County Clerk choose successors, which serve at pleasure of Legislature; can be removed and replaced by supermajority vote of Legislature; next election to take place as soon as a 'complete election cycle' can take place; veto from Acting C.E. can be overridden by simple majority.	11/14/2022	Subcommittee
33	Thomas Kadgen	Remove 'alternative sentencing administrative unit' reference from Charter	11/18/2022	Withdrawn
34	Thomas Kadgen	Extend residency requirements for Executive, County Clerk, and Comptroller to be a registered elector for three years	11/18/2022	Later limited to County Executive
80	Dave Donaldson	Replace local assessors with county-wide assessor position	4/12/2023	
84	Phil Erner	Require popular referendum to increase legislator salary	5/1/2023	
85	Phil Erner	All public meetings hybrid, in order to broaden public access to government. Live broadcast via television, World Wide Web or equivalent, and make & publish video & audio recordings, of all public meetings of Ulster County, including Boards & Commissions, for accessibility & transparency.	5/1/2023	
90	Phil Erner	Expand powers and duties of Department of the Environment beyond internal county matters	5/1/2023	
91	Phil Erner	Establish a County Environmental Advocate	5/1/2023	
95	Phil Erner	Create public election fund	5/1/2023	
96	Phil Erner	Limit campaign spending based on maximum public match	5/1/2023	
97	Phil Erner	Any county elected officer seeking a different elective office must resign to run	5/1/2023	
99	Phil Erner	Create Obsolete Laws Commission	5/1/2023	
100	Phil Erner	Use gender-friendly language throughout Charter	5/1/2023	
101	Phil Erner	Create Civic Imagination Office	5/1/2023	
116	Legislature	Add language that "department head shall perform such other and related duties as required by the County Executive and County Legislature" to C-41, C-44, C-61, C-69, C-75(B) (striking "as appropriated by the"), C-90, C-96, C-113	5/1/2023	
127	Legislature	Clarify that "in writing" shall mean "wet signature"	5/1/2023	Revision Accepted 6/8/2023
128	County Executive	Revise Charter to include gender-neutral terms	5/1/2023	
145	County Executive	Create Department of the Environment	5/1/2023	

WRITTEN SUBMISSIONS TO ULSTER COUNTY CHARTER REVISION COMMISSION

146 County Executive	Create Department of Weights and Measures	5/1/2023
147 County Executive	Rename Article XXX from "Commission of Human Rights" to "Human Rights"	5/1/2023